



CONTENTS

GENERAL INTRODUCTION

A political approach to major technological risk	1
1. A new field of enquiry into the very foundations of our industrial civilisation	3
2. Priorities for our examination	7
3. Research perspectives : Major technological risk and the exercise of collective choice	10
4. Itinerary	12
5. Layout of the thesis	15
References	17

PART ONE

A Change in the nature and the scale of major risk	25
	18
Chapter One : A series of grave warnings	21
• I <u>Saturday, June 1, 1974 : Flixborough</u>	21
1. A factory wrecked, 2450 houses damaged	21
2. The analyses of the commission of enquiry	25
1 st The company and its factory	25
2 nd The sequence of accidents (January to June 1974)	26
3 rd Beyond the actual event : An unpleasant context from the point of view of safety	31
3. Beyond the enquiry commission's analyses, more general socio-economic investigations	
1 st The non-existence of public control	32
2 nd The economic difficulties of the industrial group	32
3 rd Strong competition	33
4. Conclusion : The warning shot of Flixborough	33
References	34

• II	<u>Saturday, July 10, 1976 : Seveso</u>	35
1.	Dioxin, a formidable poison	35
1 st	Sharp toxicity, astonishing stability	38
2 nd	Probably very grave but still little known deferred effects	38
3 rd	A substance difficult to eliminate as the precedents have shown	40
2.	The factory at Meda : serious deficiencies	42
1 st	The operations seen by the Hoffmann-La Roche group	42
2 nd	Some radical criticism from Italian disparagers of Hoffmann-La Roche	43
3 rd	Observations by the commission of enquiry	44
4 ^o	The deficiency of the authorities in matters of preventive control	47
3.	The calendar of impotence	49
1 st	July 10 to 24 : The dioxin takes over ; the manufacturer is silent, bureaucracy reasserts itself	49
2 nd	July 25 to August 30 : some measures against the dioxin and much effort to save the existing installations	54
3 rd	September – October : searching for a politically economically and socially acceptable dioxin : nature would do the rest	63
4 ^o	1976-1980 : The burden of Seveso. Those in charge choose to deal with the discomfort of the people rather than with the danger. The people demanded compensation, silence and oblivion	68
4.	Balance-Sheet	71
1 st	Health	71
2 nd	Territory	73
3 rd	Economy	73
5.	Seveso : To avoid oblivion	73
	References	74
• III	<u>Thursday, March 16, 1978 : the Amoco-Cadiz</u>	77
1.	The stranding	77
1 st	The facts as they seem to have occurred out at sea	77
2 nd	The facts as they seem to have been perceived on land	81
3 rd	The impression of events received by CROSSMA (Ministry of Transport)	84
2.	Search for explanations	84
1 st	Search for explanation of events at sea	85
2 nd	Search for explanations on the part the authorities concerned did play or could have played	85
3.	Pollution	88
4.	The battle against pollution	90
1 st	The Polmar plan	90
2 nd	The application of the Polmar plan	92
3 rd	Critical observations in the parliamentary reports	93
5.	The balance-sheet of the black tide	94
1 st	The ecological impact	94
2 nd	The effects on human health	97
3 rd	The economic consequences	97
4 ^o	The financial aspect : Compensation	99
5 ^o	Legal action	99
6.	Conclusion : The absence of a system of protection	100

1 st	The mentality of seafarin people	100
2 nd	The irresponsible use of the maritime environment	100
3 ^o	The administrative insufficiency of government actions at sea	100
4 ^o	The laxity of surveillance measures on shipping and the deficiencies of means of intervention	101
5 ^o	A general situation that could only led to deadlock	102
References		103
• IV	<u>Wednesday, March 28, 1979 : The nuclear accident at Three Mile Island</u>	105
1.	Three Mile Island : a nuclear centre, an American environment	105
1 st	Technical characteristics	102
2 nd	Institutional date	108
3 ^o	The overall situation in March 1979	109
2.	Five days of technical uncertainty, political confusion and social disquiet	109
1 st	Technical uncertainties	109
2 nd	Political confusion and social disquiet	115
3.	Somes lessons to be learned from T.M.I.	121
1 st	Technical lessons	123
2 nd	Lessons on the capacity for social control of the event	124
4.	Balance-Sheet	124
5.	Conclusion	126
References		126
• V	<u>Saturday, November 10, 1979 : Toronto</u>	129
1.	The accident	129
2.	The organisation of rescue and safety for the population	130
1 st	The uncertainty about the contents of the rail carriages	130
2 nd	The response in the face of the danger : six successive evacuations	130
3 ^o	The culmination point : 240 000 people evacuated, West Toronto put on alert	133
4 ^o	Progressive control of the situation : return in 3 phases	134
3.	Balance-Sheet	135
4.	Conclusion	135
References		135
•	<u>Conclusion for five accidents : 28 dead and very serious questions remain</u>	136
Chapter Two : Radically new threats		138
• I	<u>The disasters of the industrial era : XVIII^e – XX^e siècles</u>	138
1.	The general context of safety for the populations in countries undergoing the process of industrialisation : XVII ^e and XIX ^e century	139
1 st	Great scourges which still exist in Europe	139

2 nd	Safety in everyday life	140
2.	Disasters of which the nature is not new	140
1 st	The great fires in towns	140
2 nd	The great fires in buildings	142
3 ^o	The great maritime disasters	145
3.	The new great risks of the industrial era	147
1 st	Mining disasters	147
2 nd	Railway disasters	154
3 ^o	Gunpowder and ammunition explosions	157
4 ^o	Factory and installation explosions	157
5 ^o	Great dam breaks	158
6 ^o	Air disasters	159
7 ^o	Collapse of large structures	161
8 ^o	Intoxication and poisoning	161
	References	162
• II	<u>Disasters in large scale industry : the post-war period</u>	164
1.	The safety context in industrial countries since the War	164
1 st	Great natural risks	164
2 nd	Risks connected with land occupancy	165
3 ^o	Everyday safety	166
4 ^o	The very great risks surrounding the safety problem	167
2.	Disasters known from the past	167
1 st	Fire	167
2 nd	Shipping	167
3 ^o	Mining	167
4 ^o	Railways	168
5 ^o	Explosions	168
6 ^o	Dam bursts	169
3.	Big accidents connected with newly adopted technologies	170
1 st	Fires in buildings incorporating highly inflammable materials	170
2 nd	Risks presented by highrise buildings	172
3 ^o	Aircraft accidents	173
4 ^o	Accidents on oil platforms	174
4.	Disasters linked with large scale industries	174
1 st	Fires and gas explosions in fixed installations	174
2 nd	Dispersion of toxic and highly toxic products	180
3 ^o	Transport accidents	181
	References	221
• III	<u>The threats presented by complex technological systems and large scale industrial concentration. On the threshold of twenty first century</u>	187
1 .	Beyond past events : Menaces to be studied	187
2.	Vast fields of study to be covered	190
1 st	Threats related to energy	190
2 nd	Threats linked with the chemical industry	199

3°	Threats linked with the biological sciences and genetic engineering	204
3.	Some reasons for the present danger	207
1 st	The scale of operations	207
2 nd	The nature of products stored	207
3°	Concentration of activities	207
4°	Risks caused by malevolence, sabotage and organised attack	215
4.	Technology in its social and natural contexts	215
1 st	A universe in crisis	215
2 nd	High risk technology and industry in a world pregnant with menaces and disruptions	216
	References	217
• III	<u>Despite an appearance of greater safety menaces of quite different seriousness</u>	222

PART TWO

THE MANAGEMENT OF MAJOR TECHNOLOGICAL RISK

		269
Chapter Three :	Means and tools of management	227
• I	<u>A panoply of means</u>	227
1 .	Means for the prevention of industrial risk	228
1 st	The case of France	228
2 nd	The case of Great Britain	240
3°	The case of Italy	245
2.	The battle against disasters	247
1 st	History	247
2 nd	The Civil Safety Directorate and the battle plans	248
3.	The compensation of victims	250
1 °	The commercial approach : insurance	250
2 nd	New compensation mechanisms : compensation funds	253
3°	Public aid ; the responsibility of government	256
4°	Private bodies of general interest	261
	References	262
• II	<u>The utilisation of science and spotting techniques for safety</u>	266
1.	Risk studies organised in an overall approach	266
1 °	Identification	267
2 nd	The Assessment	270
3°	Evaluation	270

2.	The utilisation of science in the civilian nuclear field : new principles in the process of systemisation.	278
1°	Knowledge and a priori prevention	278
2 nd	The determinist approach to safety : the principle of barriers and « defence in depth »"	279
3°	The probability approach to safety	281
4°	The connection between the determinist and the probability approach to safety	282
3.	Advances and delays in the non-nuclear fields	284
1°	The safety of systems in certain activities of the aeronautics and aerospace industries	284
2 nd	Safety studies and classified installations	287
4.	A completely new field for application of safety studies : Large industrial concentrations	288
	References	289
•	<u>Conclusion : An arsenal of means for the prevention and the reparation of accidents</u>	294
 Chapter four : Deficiencies and limitations of major risk management		295
• I	<u>Multiple insufficiencies</u>	
1 .	Insufficiencies in the means of prevention	295
1°	The prevention of black tides : still too limited means of intervention	296
2 nd	The follow-up on classified installation : difficulties	297
3°	The safety of nuclear centres : questions	298
2.	Insufficiencies in the means of defence	300
3.	Insufficiencies in the means of reparation	301
1°	Limits of the financial capacities of the operators and their covers	301
2 nd	Limits of compensation funds	301
• II	<u>Very serious and even absolute limitations</u>	305
1 .	The serious limits of prevention	305
1°	Limits to the prevention of black tides	305
2 nd	Limits to the prevention of large industrial disasters	306
3°	Limits in matters of nuclear safety	308
2.	Quasi-absolute obstacle in the battle against disaster	311
3.	Absolute obstacle to reparation	312
	References	313
•	<u>Conclusion : From technique to policy</u>	314

PART THREE

THE SOCIAL REGULATION OF MAJOR RISK

	379
Chapter Five : Operators, authorities, citizens facing major risks	319
• I <u>The operator : prime responsibility for the control of major risk</u>	320
1 . A host of classical failures	320
1 ° The general mental attitude ; putting the extreme risk out of mind	320
2 nd An approach to insufficiently integrated safety systems	322
3° Preceding events – the return of experience	324
4° The problem of modifications in technological processes or the life of systems	329
5° When safety gives way to the requirements of production or to safeguarding investment	329
6° Infringements	330
7° Faced with danger or disaster : the behaviour of the operator	332
8° The economic problem	335
9° The attitude of industrialists faced with major risk	336
2. The problem of the human operator	338
1 ° « Human error » : simplistic dodging of the real problem	338
2 nd Man in accident situations : the limits of adaptation	343
3° The piloting of systems	345
4° The operator placed in networks of a social nature	348
References	353
• II <u>The public authorities</u>	356
1. productive activity and safety control : an order of rank seldom denied	356
1 ° A series of cases	356
2 nd Key arrangements	359
3° The problem of independence of safety authorities	361
2. Maintaining public peace	364
References	369
• III <u>The citizen</u>	371
1. Ignorance	371
2. Acceptance and impotence	371
1 ° Passivity in general	371
2 nd Passivity : alienation beforehand	371
3° Passivity (as a psychological and political mechanism) « after the event »	373
3. Discussion and rejection	374
References	380
• <u>Conclusion : Major risk outside the actors' frame of reference</u>	382
Chapter six : Social situations to be understood and mastered	385
• I <u>Very complex networks of agents</u>	385

1 . The work tool introduced into the networks	385
2 . Integrated production in dependent entities	386
3 . A multiplicity of agents around the same probleme	387
• II <u>Complex dynamics</u>	390
1 . Conflicting Interests	390
2 . Contradictory references for action	390
3 . Multishaped conditions	391
4 . The functioning of networks in a disaster situation	393
1 ° General model of network of intervening parties	394
2 nd The network involved in the Ekofisk accident	394
3° The network involved in the TMI accident	395
4° The need for anticipation in setting up the networks	398
References	398
• <u>Conclusion : Situations which further complicate the task but give no reason to despair of the usefulness of analysis and action</u>	402

PART FOUR

POLICY

	483
Chapter Seven : When politics discard the question of major risk	405
• I <u>Defending progress : getting projects accepted</u>	406
1 . The argument for necessity and competence	406
1 ° The fantasstic leap forward achieved over three centuries thanks to industry	406
2 nd The central position of the scientist and the engineer in these achievements	407
2 . The establishment of rational options determined by experts: the problem of acceptability	408
1 ° Getting projects accepted	408
2 nd In a disaster situation : standing firm	410
3° To comfort everybody's confidence : the cement of common sense	412
References	414
• II <u>The possible results of this first scenario</u>	415
1 . Success	415
1 ° When the decisions « hold » and the projects « go through in spite of everything »	415
2 nd When simple alerts and even disasters do not cause very strong crises	417
2 . Difficulties	418

3 . Deadlock	424
References	425
• <u>Conclusion : A firm and authoritarian executive for the defence of progress</u>	427
Chapter Eight : When the boby politic opens up to the problems raised by major risk	428
• I <u>New directions for the socio-technical control of major risk</u>	428
1 . A different status for the safety function	428
1 ° Safety, a preoccupation for general management	428
2 nd The interpretation of policies for prevention, battle and reparation	430
2 . A different strategy for safety	432
1 ° Prevention adapted to the problem of major risk	432
2 nd Faced with disaster	433
3 ° Disaster management, management of a rout	436
References	438
• II <u>Innovations in the relationship between the citizen and the decisions concerning major risk</u>	440
1 . « Risk assessment » or the political evaluation or major risk	440
1 ° The typical aspect of « assessment »	440
2 nd The irreducible need for social choice	442
2 . Modalities for introducing an opening-up of politics	446
1 ° Information of the citizen	447
2 nd Consultation of the citizen	453
3 ° Mechanism for irect access by the citizen to the decision making process	462
References	463
• <u>Conclusion : An executive branch determined to face the problem fo major technological risk</u>	465
Chapter Nine : when risk calls thhe fundamentals of politics into question	466
• I <u>Democracy brushed aside by major risk</u>	466
1 . The base line : a culture of ignorance	466
1 ° An « educative redress », a « process of conditioning »	467
2 nd Managin the change-over to a new culture	468
3 ° The exclusion of the citizen in times of crisis	472
2 . The economic war : justification of these compromises of the theoretical principles of democracy	472
3 . The ultimate wager	473
References	474
• II <u>The democratic scheme confronted by the challenge of major risk</u>	475
1 . Facing the unprecedented	475
1 ° The technical challende : high risk, urgency and uncertainty	475
2 nd Democracy out of breath	477

3°	The solutions of the past	484
4°	The problem of fear	485
2 .	Operation base for a start	485
1 °	Renunciation	485
2 nd	The forces which raise the challenge	487
3 .	The Western World faced with major risk : questions about knowledge, power and democracy	490
	References	492
•	<u>Conclusion : major technological risk – a problem that subverts the body politic</u>	494

CONCLUSION GENERALE

THE SERIOUSNESS OF OUR FREEDOM

		599
1 .	Faced with major risk	495
2 .	without waiting for the twilight	498
3 .	The survival of the body politic	501
	Annex	503
	Index of cases	513
	Table of illustrations	515