# CONTENTS

## GENERAL INTRODUCTION

A political approach to major technological risk  

1. A new field of enquiry into the very foundations of our industrial civilisation  
2. Priorities for our examination  
3. Research perspectives: Major technological risk and the exercise of collective choice  
4. Itinerary  
5. Layout of the thesis  

References

## PART ONE

A Change in the nature and the scale of major risk

Chapter One: A series of grave warnings

- 1 Saturday, June 1, 1974: Flixborough

1. A factory wrecked, 2450 houses damaged

2. The analyses of the commission of enquiry
   - 1st The company and its factory
   - 2nd The sequence of accidents (January to June 1974)
   - 3rd Beyond the actual event: An unpleasant context from the point of view of safety

3. Beyond the enquiry commission's analyses, more general socio-economic investigations
   - 1st The non-existence of public control
   - 2nd The economic difficulties of the industrial group
   - 3rd Strong competition

4. Conclusion: The warning shot of Flixborough

References
II Saturday, July 10, 1976 : Seveso

1. Dioxin, a formidable poison
   1st Sharp toxicity, astonishing stability  
   2nd Probably very grave but still little known deferred effects  
   3rd A substance difficult to eliminate as the precedents have shown

2. The factory at Meda : serious deficiencies
   1st The operations seen by the Hoffmann-La Roche group
   2nd Some radical criticism from Italian disparagers of Hoffmann-La Roche
   3rd Observations by the commission of enquiry
   4th The deficiency of the authorities in matters of preventive control

3. The calendar of impotence
   1st July 10 to 24 : The dioxin takes over ; the manufacturer is silent, bureaucracy reasserts itself
   2nd July 25 to August 30 : some measures against the dioxin and much effort to save the existing installations
   3rd September – October : searching for a politically, economically and socially acceptable dioxin : nature would do the rest
   4th 1976-1980 : The burden of Seveso. Those in charge choose to deal with the discomfort of the people rather than with the danger. The people demanded compensation, silence and oblivion

4. Balance-Sheet
   1st Health
   2nd Territory
   3rd Economy

5. Seveso : To avoid oblivion

References

III Thursday, March 16, 1978 : the Amoco-Cadiz

1. The stranding
   1st The facts as they seem to have occurred out at sea
   2nd The facts as they seem to have been perceived on land
   3rd The compression of events received by CROSSMA (Ministry of Transports)

2. Search for explanations
   1st Search for explanation of events at sea
   2nd Search for explanations or the part the authorities concerned did play or could have played

3. Pollution

4. The battle against pollution
   1st The Polmar plan
   2nd The application of the Polmar plan
   3rd Critical observations in the parliamentary reports

5. The balance-sheet of the black tide
   1st The ecological impact
   2nd The effects on human health
   3rd The economic consequences
   4th The financial aspect : Compensation
   5th Legal action

6. Conclusion : The absence of a system of protection
1st The mentality of seafarin people
2nd The irresponsible use of the maritime environment
3rd The administrative insufficiency of government actions at sea
4th The laxity of surveillance measures on shipping and the
deficiencies of means of intervention
5th A general situation that could only led to deadlock

References

• IV Wednesday, March 28, 1979: The nuclear accident at Three Mile Island

1. Three Mile Island: a nuclear centre, an American environment
   1st Technical characteristics
   2nd Institutional date
   3rd The overall situation in March 1979

2. Five days of technical uncertainty, political confusion
   and social disquiet
   1st Technical uncertainties
   2nd Political confusion and social disquiet

3. Some lessons to be learned from T.M.I.
   1st Technical lessons
   2nd Lessons on the capacity for social control of the
   event

4. Balance-Sheet

5. Conclusion

References

• V Saturday, November 10, 1979: Toronto

1. The accident

2. The organisation of rescue and safety for the population
   1st The uncertainty about the contents of the rail carriages
   2nd The response in the face of the danger: six successive evacuations
   3rd The culmination point: 240,000 people evacuated,
   West Toronto put on alert
   4th Progressive control of the situation: return in 3 phases

3. Balance-Sheet

4. Conclusion

References

• Conclusion for five accidents: 28 dead and very serious questions remain

Chapter Two: Radically new threats

• I The disasters of the industrial era: XVIII° – XX° siècles

1. The general context of safety for the populations in countries
   undergoing the process of industrialisation: XVII° and XIX° century
   1st Great scourges which still exist in Europe
### 3° Threats linked with the biological sciences and genetic engineering

204

### 3. Some reasons for the present danger

1° The scale of operations
2° The nature of products stored
3° Concentration of activities
4° Risks caused by malevolence, sabotage and organised attack

207

### 4. Technology in its social and natural contexts

1° A universe in crisis
2° High risk technology and industry in a world pregnant with menaces and disruptions

215

### References

- III Despite an appearance of greater safety menaces of quite different seriousness

222

---

### PART TWO

THE MANAGEMENT OF MAJOR TECHNOLOGICAL RISK

269

#### Chapter Three : Means and tools of management

- I A panoply of means

227

1. Means for the prevention of industrial risk

1° The case of France
2° The case of Great Britain
3° The case of Italy

228

2. The battle against disasters

1° History
2° The Civil Safety Directorate and the battle plans

247

3. The compensation of victims

1° The commercial approach : insurance
2° New compensation mechanisms : compensation funds
3° Public aid : the responsibility of government
4° Private bodies of general interest

250

### References

- II The utilisation of science and spotting techniques for safety

266

1. Risk studies organised in an overall approach

1° Identification
2° The Assessment
3° Evaluation

266
2. The utilisation of science in the civilian nuclear field: new principles in the process of systemisation.

1° Knowledge and a priori prevention  
2nd The determinist approach to safety: the principle of barriers and « defence in depth »  
3° The probability approach to safety  
4° The connection between the determinist and the probability approach to safety  

3. Advances and delays in the non-nuclear fields  
1 ° The safety of systems in certain activities of the aeronautics and arrospace industries  
2nd Safety studies and classified installations  

4. A completely new field for application of safety studies: Large industrial concentrations  

References  

• Conclusion: An arsenal of means for the prevention and the reparation of accidents

Chapter four: Deficiencies and limitations of major risk management  

• I Multiple insufficiencies  

1. Insufficiencies in the means of prevention  
1° The prevention of black tides: still too limited means of intervention  
2nd The follow-up on classified installation: difficulties  
3° The safety of nuclear centres: questions  

2. Insufficiencies in the means of defence  

3. Insufficiencies in the means of reparation  
1° Limits of the financial capacities of the operators and their covers  
2nd Limits of compensation funds  

• II Very serious and even absolute limitations  

1. The serious limits of prevention  
1° Limits to the prevention of black tides  
2nd Limits to the prevention of large industrial disasters  
3° Limits in matters of nuclear safety  

2. Quasi-absolute obstacle in the battle against disaster  

3. Absolute obstacle to reparation  

References  

• Conclusion: From technique to policy
PART THREE

THE SOCIAL REGULATION OF MAJOR RISK

Chapter Five : Operators, authorities, citizens facing major risks

1. The operator : prime responsibility for the control of major risk
   1° The general mental attitude ; putting the extreme risk out of mind
   2° An approach to insufficiently integrated safety systems
   3° Preceding events – the return of experience
   4° The problem of modifications in technological processes or the life of systems
   5° When safety gives way to the requirements of production or to safeguarding investment
   6° Infringements
   7° Faced with danger or disaster : the behaviour of the operator
   8° The economic problem
   9° The attitude of industrialists faced with major risk

2. The problem of the human operator
   1° « Human error » : simplistic dodging of the real problem
   2° Man in accident situations : the limits of adaptation
   3° The piloting of systems
   4° The operator placed in networks of a social nature

References

II. The public authorities

1. productive activity and safety control : an order of rank seldom denied
   1° A series of cases
   2° Key arrangements
   3° The problem of independence of safety authorities

2. Maintaining public peace

References

III. The citizen

1. Ignorance

2. Acceptance and impotence
   1° Passivity in general
   2° Passivity : alienation beforehand
   3° Passivity (as a psychological and political mechanism) « after the event »

3. Discussion and rejection

References

Conclusion : Major risk outside the actors’ frame of reference

Chapter six : Social situations to be understood and mastered

1. Very complex networks of agents
1. The work tool introduced into the networks 385
2. Integrated production in dependent entities 386
3. A multiplicity of agents around the same problem 387

• II Complex dynamics 390
1. Conflicting Interests 390
2. Contradictory references for action 390
3. Multishaped conditions 391
4. The functioning of networks in a disaster situation 393
  1° General model of network of intervening parties 394
  2nd The network involved in the Ekofisk accident 394
  3° The network involved in the TMI accident 395
  4° The need for anticipation in setting up the networks 398

References 398

• Conclusion: Situations which further complicate the task but give no reason to despair of the usefulness of analysis and action 402

PART FOUR

CHAPTER SEVEN: When politics discard the question of major risk 405

• I Defending progress: getting projects accepted 406
1. The argument for necessity and competence 406
  1° The fantastic leap forward achieved over three centuries thanks to industry 406
  2nd The central position of the scientist and the engineer in these achievements 407
2. The establishment of rational options determined by experts: the problem of acceptability 408
  1° Getting projects accepted 408
  2nd In a disaster situation: standing firm 410
  3° To comfort everybody’s confidence: the cement of common sense 412

References 414

• II The possible results of this first scenario 415
1. Success 415
  1° When the decisions « hold » and the projects « go through in spite of everything » 415
  2nd When simple alerts and even disasters do not cause very strong crises 417
2. Difficulties 418
3. Deadlock

References

• Conclusion: A firm and authoritarian executive for the defence of progress

Chapter Eight: When the body politic opens up to the problems raised by major risk

• I New directions for the socio-technical control of major risk

1. A different status for the safety function
   1° Safety, a preoccupation for general management
   2° The interpretation of policies for prevention, battle and reparation

2. A different strategy for safety
   1° Prevention adapted to the problem of major risk
   2° Faced with disaster
   3° Disaster management, management of a rout

References

• II Innovations in the relationship between the citizen and the decisions concerning major risk

1. « Risk assessment » or the political evaluation or major risk
   1° The typical aspect of « assessment »
   2° The irreducible need for social choice

2. Modalities for introducing an opening-up of politics
   1° Information of the citizen
   2° Consultation of the citizen
   3° Mechanism for direct access by the citizen to the decision making process

References

• Conclusion: An executive branch determined to face the problem to major technological risk

Chapter Nine: When risk calls the fundamentals of politics into question

• I Democracy brushed aside by major risk

1. The base line: a culture of ignorance
   1° An « educative redress », a « process of conditioning »
   2° Managing the change-over to a new culture
   3° The exclusion of the citizen in times of crisis

2. The economic war: justification of these compromises of the theoretical principles of democracy

3. The ultimate wager

References

• II The democratic scheme confronted by the challenge of major risk

1. Facing the unprecedented
   1° The technical challenge: high risk, urgency and uncertainty
   2° Democracy out of breath
3° The solutions of the past 484
4° The problem of fear 485

2. Operation base for a start 485
   1° Renunciation 485
   2° The forces which raise the challenge 487

3. The Western World faced with major risk: questions about knowledge, power and democracy 490

References 492

• Conclusion: major technological risk – a problem that subverts the body politic 494

CONCLUSION GENERALE
THE SERIOUSNESS OF OUR FREEDOM 599

1. Faced with major risk 495
2. without waiting for the twilight 498
3. The survival of the body politic 501

Annex 503
Index of cases 513
Table of illustrations 515